1	PROSKAUER ROSE LLP		
	ELISE M. BLOOM (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) ebloom@proskauer.com		
2	NEIL H. ABRAMSON (admitted <i>pro hac vi</i>	ce)	
3	nabramson@proskauer.com		
4	ADAM M. LUPION (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )		
	alupion@proskauer.com RACHEL S. PHILION (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )		
5	rphilion@proskauer.com		
6	NOA M. BADDISH (admitted pro hac vice)		
7	nbaddish@proskauer.com JOSHUA S. FOX (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> )		
	jfox@proskauer.com		
8	Eleven Times Square		
9	New York, NY 10036 Telephone: (212) 969-3000		
10	Facsimile: (212) 969-2900		
11		PROSKAUER ROSE LLP	
12		MARK W. BATTEN (admitted <i>pro hac vice</i> ) hbatten@proskauer.com	
	2029 Century Park East, 24th Floor S	AMANTHA R. MANELIN (admitted pro hac vice)	
13		manelin@proskauer.com One International Place	
14		Boston, MA 02110-2600 Felephone: (617) 526-9600	
15	F	acsimile: (617) 526-9899	
16	Attorneys for Defendants		
	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
17	FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
18	AARON SENNE, et al.,	Case No. CV 14-00608 JCS (consolidated	
19	Plaintiffs,	with 3:14-cv-03289-JCS)	
20	Fiantins,	Hon. Joseph C. Spero	
	vs.		
21	OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER OF	<u>CLASS ACTION</u>	
22	BASEBALL, an unincorporated association doing business as MAJOR LEAGUE	DECLARATION OF ELISE M.	
23	BASEBALL, et al.,	BLOOM IN SUPPORT OF	
24	Defendants.	DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT	
25			
26			
27			
<i>- '</i>		<del></del>	

1. I

4

5

6 7

8

9 10

11

1213

1415

16

1718

19

2021

22

2324

25

26

27

- 1. I am a partner at Proskauer Rose, LLP, counsel for all Defendants in this matter.
- I submit this declaration in support of the Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs'
   Motion for Partial Summary Judgment.
- 3. I have personal knowledge of the facts contained in this declaration, and if called to testify, I could and would testify competently thereto.
- 4. Prior to the close of fact discovery in June 2016, the Clubs produced gross receipts, on a cash accounting basis, by month, for their spring training facility "establishments" in Florida or Arizona during the relevant time period. The Clubs produced the information in summary fashion as set forth in verified interrogatory answers or sworn declarations.
- 5. After the close of fact discovery in June 2016, Plaintiffs demanded that the Clubs produce underlying source documents relating to the gross receipts.
- 6. The parties agreed to defer discovery disputes raised prior to or after the close of fact discovery in June 2016 until after the Court's ruling on Plaintiffs' motion for reconsideration.
- 7. On March 7, 2017, the Court issued its Order regarding Plaintiffs' motion for reconsideration, and on April 21, 2017, Defendants agreed to produce the underlying source records Plaintiffs requested related to gross receipts. On May 5, 2017, the Court stayed discovery pending the parties' cross-appeals to the Ninth Circuit.
- 8. Defendants produced the underlying source records related to gross receipts when the discovery stay was lifted without any claim from Plaintiffs that those productions were deficient in any respect.
- 9. Plaintiffs had the opportunity to probe the Clubs' responses and verify the gross receipts information during fact discovery, including but not limited to, during the Clubs' Rule 30(b)(6) depositions and during supplemental fact discovery that concluded on July 1, 2021.
  - 10. Attached hereto as Exhibit 1 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of

28

of Brandon Henderson's Deposition ("Henderson"), taken on February 3, 2016.

- 24. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 15** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Bryan Henry's Deposition ("Henry"), taken on June 28, 2021.
- 25. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 16** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Mitchell Hilligoss' Deposition ("Hilligoss"), taken on January 20, 2016.
- 26. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 17** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Ryan Hutson's Deposition ("Hutson"), taken on November 10, 2015.
- 27. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 18** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Daniel Jimenez's Deposition ("Jimenez"), taken on June 10, 2016.
- 28. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 19** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Jake Kahaulelio's Deposition ("Kahaulelio"), taken on October 22, 2015.
- 29. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 20** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Ryan Khoury's Deposition ("Khoury"), taken on February 10, 2016.
- 30. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 21** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Ryan Kiel's Deposition ("Kiel"), taken on December 10, 2015.
- 31. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 22** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Christopher Lashmet's Deposition ("Lashmet"), taken on April 5, 2016.
- 32. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 23** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Matthew Lawson's Deposition ("Lawson"), taken on December 2, 2015.
- 33. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 24** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Michael Liberto's Deposition ("Liberto"), taken on November 11, 2015.
- 34. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 25** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Erik Lis's Deposition ("Lis"), taken on May 26, 2016.
- 35. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 26** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Barret Loux's Deposition ("Loux"), taken on April 26, 2016.
  - 36. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 27** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts

of Kyle Mahoney's Deposition ("Mahoney"), taken on April 12, 2016. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 28** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Tanner Mathis' Deposition ("Mathis"), taken on June 9, 2016. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 29** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Bradley McAtee's Deposition ("McAtee"), taken on December 15, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 30** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Aaron Meade's Deposition ("Meade"), taken on December 3, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 31** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Jeff Nadeau's Deposition ("Nadeau"), taken on November 24, 2015. Attached hereto as Exhibit 32 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Philip Negus's Deposition ("Negus"), taken on July 9, 2016. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 33** is a true and correct copy of relevant excerpts of Brett Newsome's Deposition ("Newsome"), taken on January 21, 2016. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 34** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Kyle Nicholson's Deposition ("Nicholson"), taken on November 18, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 35** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Oliver Odle's Deposition ("Odle"), taken on December 1, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 36** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Jacob Opitz's Deposition ("Optiz"), taken on November 23, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 37** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Roberto Ortiz's Deposition ("Ortiz"), taken on December 9, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 38** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Tim Pahuta's Deposition ("Pahuta"), taken on December 17, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 39** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Dustin Pease's Deposition ("Pease"), taken on December 14, 2015. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 40** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts

of Steven Proscia's Deposition ("Proscia"), taken on April 26, 2016.

- 50. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 41** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of David Quinowski's Deposition ("Quinowski"), taken on January 5, 2016.
- 51. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 42** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Gaspar Santiago's Deposition ("Santiago"), taken on December 8, 2015.
- 52. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 43** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Cody Sedlock's Deposition ("Sedlock"), taken on May 10, 2021.
- 53. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 44** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Aaron Senne's Deposition ("Senne"), taken on October 27, 2015.
- 54. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 45** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of James Swift's Deposition ("Swift"), taken on March 30, 2016.
- 55. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 46** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Adam Veres's Deposition ("Veres"), taken on May 17, 2016.
- 56. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 47** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Kyle Von Tungeln's Deposition ("Von Tungeln"), taken on May 23, 2016.
- 57. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 48** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Joel Weeks' Deposition ("Weeks"), taken on January 6, 2016.
- 58. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 49** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Kyle Woodruff's Deposition ("Woodruff"), taken on October 21, 2015.
- 59. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 50** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Nelfi Zapata's Deposition ("Zapata"), taken on June 9, 2016.
- 60. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 51** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Bill Bavasi's Deposition ("Bavasi"), taken on December 15, 2015.
- 61. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 52** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Shedrick Bennett's Deposition ("Bennett"), taken on January 12, 2016.
  - 62. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 53** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts

of Larry Broadway's Deposition ("Broadway"), taken on January 20, 2016.

- 63. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 54** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Douglas Davis's Deposition ("D. Davis"), taken on January 21, 2016.
- 64. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 55** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Christopher Gwynn's Deposition ("Gwynn"), taken on October 21, 2015.
- 65. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 56** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Gabe Kapler's Deposition ("Kapler"), taken on February 4, 2016.
- 66. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 57** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Roy Krasik's Deposition ("Krasik"), taken on June 29, 2016.
- 67. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 58** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Keith Lieppman's Deposition ("Lieppman"), taken on January 28, 2016.
- 68. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 59** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Quinton McCracken's Deposition ("McCracken"), taken on February 19, 2016.
- 69. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 60** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of James Rantz' Deposition ("Rantz"), taken on December 8, 2015.
- 70. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 61** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Bobby Scales' Deposition ("Scales"), taken on December 16, 2015.
- 71. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 62** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Fred Seymour's Deposition ("Seymour"), taken on June 24, 2016.
- 72. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 63** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Randall Smith's Deposition ("R. Smith"), taken on February 2, 2016.
- 73. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 64** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of Frank Viola's Deposition ("Viola"), taken on October 29, 2015.
- 74. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 65** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of John Vuch's Deposition ("Vuch"), taken on November 20, 2015.
  - 75. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 66** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts

- 88. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 79** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Los Angeles Dodgers ("Dodgers"), taken on May 24, 2016.
- 89. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 80** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of Major League Baseball ("MLB"), taken on June 8, 2016.
- 90. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 81** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Miami Marlins ("Marlins"), taken on April 14, 2016.
- 91. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 82** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Milwaukee Brewers ("Brewers"), taken on April 21, 2016.
- 92. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 83** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Minnesota Twins ("Twins"), taken on May 4, 2016 and May 5, 2016.
- 93. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 84** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the New York Mets ("Mets"), taken on May 11, 2016.
- 94. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 85** is a true and correct copy of relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the New York Yankees ("Yankees"), taken on June 3, 2016.
- 95. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 86** is a true and correct copy of relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Oakland Athletics ("Athletics"), taken on May 17, 2016 and May 19, 2016.
- 96. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 87** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Pittsburgh Pirates ("Pirates"), taken on May 25, 2016.
- 97. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 88** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the San Diego Padres ("Padres"), taken on June 13, 2016.
- 98. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 89** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the San Francisco Giants ("Giants"), taken on May 19, 2016.
- 99. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 90** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Seattle Mariners ("Mariners"), taken on May 10, 2016.

100.	Attached hereto as Exhibit 91 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts	
of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the St. Louis Cardinals ("Cardinals"), taken on May 16, 2016.		
101.	Attached hereto as Exhibit 92 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts	
of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Tampa Bay Rays ("Rays"), taken on June 23, 2021.		
102.	Attached hereto as Exhibit 93 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts	
of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Texas Rangers ("Rangers"), taken on April 28, 2016.		
103.	Attached hereto as Exhibit 94 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts	
of the 30(b)(6) Deposition of the Toronto Blue Jays ("Blue Jays"), taken on June 2, 2016.		
104.	Attached hereto as Exhibit 95 is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts	
of J. Michael Dennis' Deposition ("Dennis"), taken on September 20, 2021.		
i e		

DECLARATION OF ELISE M. BLOOM IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT- CASE No. 14-00608-JCS (consolidated with 3:14-cv-03289-JCS)

110. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 101** is a true and correct copy of a Minnesota Twins Spring Training schedule, dated March 2019, bearing Bates Number MIN0017504. Because this

document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is

being filed along with this motion.

being filed along with this motion.

111. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 102** is a true and correct copy of a New York Mets Instructional League schedule, dated September 2014, bearing Bates Number NYM0003376. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.

- 112. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 103** is a true and correct copy of a New York Mets Championship Season schedule, dated April 2014, bearing Bates Numbers NYM0004201-NYM0004202. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 113. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 104** is a true and correct copy of an Oakland Athletics Instructional League schedule, dated September 2019, bearing Bates Number OAK0009829. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 114. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 105** is a true and correct copy of a San Diego Padres Championship Season schedule, bearing Bates Numbers SDP0003749-SDP0003750. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.

- 115. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 106** is a true and correct copy of a San Diego Padres Spring Training schedule, dated March 2014, bearing Bates Number SDP0007443. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 116. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 107** is a true and correct copy of a Texas Rangers Extended Spring Training schedule, dated April 2011, bearing Bates Number TEX0031305. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 117. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 108** is a true and correct copy of a Texas Rangers Championship Season schedule, bearing Bates Number TEX0031332. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 118. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 109** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the Arizona Diamondbacks Player Development Manual, bearing Bates Numbers ARI0000178 and ARI0000218-ARI0000222. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 119. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 110** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the Kansas City Royals Minor League Handbook, bearing Bates Number KAN0028011.
- 120. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 111** is a true and correct copy of the relevant excerpts of the Cincinnati Reds Player Development Manual, bearing Bates Numbers CIN0000001 and CIN0000105-CIN0000113. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed

under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.

9

10 11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26 27

28

Attached hereto as **Exhibit 112** is a true and correct copy of the Houston Astros 121. Criteria for Advancement and Player Plans, bearing Bates Numbers HOU0000983-HOU0000984. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an

administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.

- 122. Attached hereto as Exhibit 113 is a true and correct copy of the Kansas City Royals Criteria for Advancement, bearing Bates Numbers KAN000647-KAN000649. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- Attached hereto as **Exhibit 114** is a true and correct copy of the Seattle Mariners Criteria for Advancement, bearing Bates Number SEA0001070. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 124. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 115** is a true and correct copy of the Chicago Cub Standards, bearing Bates Numbers CHC0016530-CHC0016536. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 125. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 116** is a true and correct copy of the Los Angeles Angels Level by Level Pitching Development Objectives, bearing Bates Numbers LAA0000179-LAA0000181. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.

- 126. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 117** is a true and correct copy of the Los Angeles Angels Level by Level Hitting Development Objectives, bearing Bates Numbers LAA0000200-LAA0000202. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 127. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 118** is a true and correct copy of the Miami Marlins Goals for Levels, bearing Bates Numbers MIA002362-MIA002365. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 128. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 119** is a true and correct copy of the Texas Rangers Pitchers Level to Level Development, bearing Bates Numbers TEX0028698-TEX0028699. Because this document has been marked as "Confidential-Restricted" pursuant to the Parties' stipulated protective order (Dkt. No. 233), it has been filed under seal and an administrative motion is being filed along with this motion.
- 129. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 120** is a true and correct copy of a memo dated February 13, 2019, bearing Bates Number CHC0032495.
- 130. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 121** is a true and correct copy of a memo dated March 1, 2021, bearing Bates Numbers SFG0030032-SFG0030033.
- 131. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 122** is a true and correct copy of a memo dated March 19, 2020, bearing Bates Number MLB0030635.
- 132. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 123** is a true and correct copy of an email dated June 12, 2011, bearing Bates Numbers MLBGAGN0000544-MLBGAGN0000545.
- 133. Attached hereto as **Exhibit 124** is a true and correct copy of Kris Watts' monthly salaries, bearing Bates Number WAS0000629.
  - 134. Attached hereto as Exhibit 125 is a true and correct copy of Kris Watts' eBIS

Case 3:14-cv-00608-JCS Document 1009 Filed 11/24/21 Page 16 of 16